

# SUNSET AUDIT REPORT

2016-S4

---

Bidding Review Board

Purchasing Department

August 12, 2016

---

MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE  
Internal Audit Department  
632 W 6th Avenue, Suite 600  
P.O. Box 196650  
Anchorage, Alaska 99519-6650  
[www.muni.org/departments/internal\\_audit](http://www.muni.org/departments/internal_audit)



INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT  
Michael Chadwick, CICA  
Acting Director  
Phone: (907) 343-4438  
Fax: (907) 343-4370  
E-Mail: [chadwickmb@muni.org](mailto:chadwickmb@muni.org)



# Municipality of Anchorage

Ethan Berkowitz, Mayor

Internal Audit Department

August 12, 2016

Honorable Mayor and Members of the Assembly:

I am pleased to present **Sunset Audit Report 2016-S4, Bidding Review Board, Purchasing Department**, for your review. A brief summary of the report is presented below.

In accordance with Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14, we have performed a sunset audit of the Bidding Review Board. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Bidding Review Board should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, resolutions and agendas, and member authorization and participation.

Based on our review of Board meeting audio recordings, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Bidding Review Board be reauthorized.

The Bidding Review Board will sunset on October 14, 2016, unless reauthorized by the Assembly.

Michael Chadwick, CICA  
Acting Director, Internal Audit



# Municipality of Anchorage

Ethan Berkowitz, Mayor

Internal Audit Department

August 12, 2016

**Sunset Audit Report 2016-S4  
Bidding Review Board  
Purchasing Department**

**Introduction.** We have performed a sunset audit of the Bidding Review Board (Board) as required by Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14 which states:

*“The Municipal Clerk shall notify the Assembly and the Mayor by assembly memorandum at least 120 days prior to the sunset of any board or commission, and an ordinance for reauthorization shall be introduced through the Assembly Chair with the assembly memorandum. The assembly memorandum shall include direction to the Office of Internal Audit to audit the board or commission under Anchorage Municipal Code section 3.20.110 D.3. and 4. The Office of Internal Audit shall report its findings to the Mayor and Assembly at least 60 days, prior to sunset, prior to vote by the Assembly on reauthorization.”*

**Objective and Scope.** The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Board should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, Board resolutions and agendas, and Board member authorization and participation.

The audit was conducted in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards, except for the requirement of an external quality control review, and accordingly, included tests of accounting records and such other auditing procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances. The audit was performed during the period of June through July 2016.

**Overall Evaluation.** Based on our review of Board meeting audio recordings, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Bidding Review Board be reauthorized.

## **SUNSET FACTORS**

The following factors were used in our evaluation and are presented for information to the Mayor and Assembly:

1. **Name of Board.**

Bidding Review Board

2. **Sunset Date.**

October 14, 2016

3. **The purpose and goal of the Board.**

*Anchorage Municipal Code (AMC) 4.50.020.D, Bidding review board, states "The bidding review board shall review those proposed contracts of the municipality which may be referred to it by the mayor or the assembly for appropriateness of the award."*

*In addition, AMC 7.20.130.A, Appeals, states "Any person adversely affected by the provisions of chapters 7.10, 7.15 or 7.20, or regulations promulgated thereunder, or by any acts of the municipality in connection with the award of a municipal contract, may request that the mayor or assembly refer the matter to the bidding review board."*

**4. Have Board members been appointed?**

*AMC 4.50.020.A states "There is established a bidding review board consisting of nine members including:*

- 1. One member from the board of building regulation examiners and appeals;*
- 2. One member from the Municipal Light and Power Utility Commission;*
- 3. Two members from the general public, preferably experienced with bidding activities common to the municipality;*
- 4. One member from the Anchorage Water and Wastewater Utility Board of Directors; and*
- 5. Four members from the construction and labor industries."*

**Audit Finding.** Currently, the Board is staffed with eight of the required nine members. However, the board member representing the Municipal Light and Power (ML&P) Utility Commission is no longer a ML&P Utility Commission member.

<b><u>Board Member</u></b>	<b><u>Most Recent Assembly Confirmation</u></b>	<b><u>Term Expiration Date</u></b>
Scott Bohne (Board of Building Regulation Examiners and Appeals)	11-19-13	10-14-16
David Dickhaus (Construction and Labor Industries)	11-19-13	10-14-16
Frederick Kaltenbach (General Public)	11-19-13	10-14-16
Robert Shake (ML&P Utility Commission)	11-19-13	10-14-16
Timothy Sullivan (Anchorage Water and Wastewater Utility Board of Directors)	11-19-13	10-14-16
Paul Michelsohn (Construction and Labor Industries)	8-26-14	10-14-17
Don Winchester (General Public)	11-24-15	10-14-18
Ric Davidge (Construction and Labor Industries)	12-22-15	10-14-18
Vacant		

Source: Assembly Memorandums and Mayor's Office



5. **Are the terms of the Board members current?**

*AMC 4.05.040, Terms, states "Except as otherwise specified in this Code, the regular term of each member of a board or commission is three years commencing on October 15 of the year in which appointed and ending three years thereafter on October 14, provided however, to avoid a vacancy until new appointments can be made and confirmed, an appointed member's term is extended until a new appointment is confirmed or a maximum of 120 days which ever occurs first. The terms of initial or subsequent appointments to a board or commission shall be staggered so that, as nearly as possible, a pro rata number of its members shall be appointed each year of the established regular term of office."*

**Audit Finding.** The terms for the eight Board members are current.

6. **Are positions deemed vacant after the maximum number of absences?**

*AMC 4.05.060.A, Attendance requirements; vacancies, states ". . . a vacancy shall occur if a member during any 12-month period while in office:*

1. *Is absent from three regular meetings without excuse;*
2. *Is absent from:*
  - a. *six regular meetings; or*
  - b. *eight regular meetings for members of the planning and zoning commission, platting board, or zoning board of examiners and appeals; or*
3. *Fails to attend a two-thirds majority of the regular meetings."*

**Audit Finding.** No members were absent from three regular meetings without an excuse within any 12-month period.

No members were absent from six regular meetings within any 12-month period.

Four members failed to attend two thirds of the regular meetings within any 12-month period. These members have not been removed from the Board. According to the Purchasing Officer, the requirement to attend two thirds of the meetings is not practical for this Board, as the Board only meets when required.

7. **Does the Board meet regularly?**

*AMC 4.05.090, Meetings, states "A board or commission shall hold regular monthly meetings at such time and place as may from time to time be designated by the board or commission, but meetings need not be held if no business is pending. Boards and commissions shall advise the public of their meeting schedules, or publicly advertise their meetings where necessitated by statutory requirements. The chairman of a board or commission, or the municipal employee who is designated as an ex officio member of the board or commission pursuant to section 4.05.140, or a majority of the board or commission, may call a special meeting of the board or commission. Meetings of all boards and commissions shall be open to the public, except for an executive session, from which the public may be excluded."*

**Audit Finding.** From January 2015 through June 2016, it appears the Board met at least three times. The Board did not have a regular meeting schedule. Instead, the Board met when proposed Municipal contracts were referred to it by the Mayor or Assembly for appropriateness of the award. We were unable to find any evidence that meetings were publicly announced on the Boards and Commissions Events' website or the Municipality's Public Notices website. However, we did note that communication was provided to the impacted parties.

8. **Are minutes taken and published?**

*AMC 4.05.130, Reports, minutes and public hearing records, states "A board or commission shall keep minutes of the board or commission proceedings, and such minutes shall record*

*the vote of each member physically present upon every question formally presented to the board or commissions for its consideration. The minutes shall be maintained in the custody of the municipal agency which supplies staff support to the board or commission and shall be a public record, open to inspection by any person.”*

**Audit Finding.** Board minutes were not published for the three Board meetings from January 2015 through June 2016. Although published minutes were not completed, handwritten notes for two meetings and audio recordings of all three meetings were available at the Purchasing Department. The public is informed of the Board’s decisions through Assembly Information Memorandums. Board decisions are also announced to all impacted parties at the conclusion of the Board meetings.

9. **Do meetings have action items or other business?**

*AMC 4.50.020.E states “All actions involving contract disputes before the board shall be recorded electronically. Recommendations for resolution shall be forwarded to the assembly at its next regular or special meeting after final action of the bidding review board. The assembly may require a verbatim transcript of the hearings before the bidding review board and assess expenses against each party for production of the transcript as directed by the assembly. The assembly may limit participation in a matter which has proceeded before the bidding review board to written briefs, providing a verbatim transcript is available for the bidding review board proceedings.”*

**Audit Finding.** The Board provided one recommendation to the Assembly from January 2015 through June 2016. In addition, on July 12, 2016, the Board issued another recommendation based on its June 22, 2016, Board meeting.